

|  |
| --- |
| **2023 Self-Study Report for Elementary Education AA Program** |
| **Instructions**: The following pages will guide your submission of your Academic Program Review Self-Study. Please type your responses directly into the document. The completed self-study instrument and all attachments must be submitted to the Academic Program Review Coordinator and your Academic Dean by **September 22, 2023.** **March 3, 2023 September 21, 2023 October 25, 2023**  **Nov-Dec 2023 Every Fall from 2024-2027** |
| **Program Under Review** |
| **Degree: Elementary Education AAEE****Certificates: Elementary Education Post Baccalaureate Program** | **If the program has gone through accreditation in the past year, the information from the accreditation packet can be inserted into the corresponding areas on the self-study.** | **Contact Information for lead on** **Self-Study****Name: Cara Steiner****Campus: SPC****Phone: 520-494-5035****Email: cara.steiner@centralaz.edu****Date of APR Completion:** | **Peer Reviewers Name and Role** |
| Areas in **grey** are used by the peer review team to give feedback on your self-study and do not require your contribution.**Peer Reviewers:** **Amanda Potts – Professor of Culinary Arts****Faviola Barrancas – Enrollment Advisor****Wayne Pryor - Professor of Astronomy & Geology** |

|  |
| --- |
| **I. Program Description, Mission, Vision, & Equity Statement**  |
| **1. What is the description of the program as stated in the current CAC catalog:** (Should contain: description, program certifications, accreditations, awards, and skills attained.)**AAEE**: The Associate of Arts in Elementary Education (AAEE) Degree is appropriate for students who require practical and professional skills and knowledge that can lead to upper division programs in elementary education and/or special education and/or preparation for para-educators. | **Does the program description provide the following information? a) A synopsis of the program and curricular outcomes.** | **Peer Review Comments:** Is the certificate also in the catalog? Should it be listed here? -(most sections are 3’s for me-)[3’s for all 3 for me - |
| Exemplary3  | Adequate 2 | **Opportunity for Improvement 1** |
| **Program certifications, accreditations, and awards.** |
| Exemplary3 | Adequate2 | **Opportunity for Improvement 1** |
| **The skills that graduate from the program will attain.** |
| Exemplary3 | Adequate2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **2. Does your program have a mission and/or a vision statement? If it does, please write them below and indicate where they appear.** **Vision**: Central Arizona Colleges’ AAEE program prepares educators to meet the needs of every learner through innovative pedagogy and practice, rigorous coursework, scholarship of 21st century skills, and continuous improvement.  **Mission**: The AAEE program is committed to introducing and preparing the 21st-century teacher in thoughtful and deliberate knowledge of the complexities of teaching and learning that encompass inclusion, equity, and justice. The AAEE vigorously engages educator candidates in application of principled practice, inspires excellence in pedagogy and scholarship; promotes reflective, innovative and collaborative teaching methods to maximize student learning and achievement; endorses servant leadership in educational communities; and engages a diverse and global community of learners with purpose and passion. | **Does the program have a mission and/or a vision statement? If so, are the program’s mission or vision statements clear and reflective of the program?** | **Looks good to me****[3 for both vision and mission** **Looks good** |
| Exemplary **3** | Adequate2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **3. Describe how the program’s description, mission and/or vision aligns with the College’s Mission and Vision:****CAC Vision and Mission Statements:****Vision:**Central Arizona’s premier choice in education and career excellence.**Mission:**Central Arizona College serves as a TRUE Learning community by empowering our students and staff to succeed.**Teaching. Reaching. Understanding. Empowering. Learning.****CAC Vision**Central Arizona’s premier choice in education and career excellence.**CAC Mission**Central Arizona College serves as a TRUE Learning community by empowering our students and staff to succeed.**Teaching. Reaching. Understanding. Empowering. Learning.**The AAEE vision and mission closely align with the college to be leaders of innovation, learner success and the center for educational opportunities in the surrounding diverse communities. The AAEE program offers a quality teacher preparation program sensitive to the dynamic needs of the surrounding community embracing diversity of students and their families. The AAEE program delivers innovative, quality coursework and professional experience aligned with Arizona’s public state universities and Baccalaureate degree programs for elementary, secondary, and special education focused on students entering the field of education and teaching. CAC’s education program consists of workforce development in the field of education/teaching through required AAEE components of EDU221, Introduction to Education and the newly approved post-baccalaureate program for community members possessing a bachelor’s degree in any discipline. The AAEE affords educational opportunities for program students to work face-to-face in an authentic classroom experience where innovation and opportunities present the challenges, rewards, and impetuses of working in the diverse communities of Pinal County. These opportunities provide a real-life glimpse into the economic, environmental, and cultural challenges presented in our schools today. Requiring CAC students to spend time learning and observing in working classrooms of K-12 education offers personal and professional growth and a glimpse into the reality of their chosen profession.  AAEE courses are designed to inform and prepare students about the laws, history, and exceptionalities directly relating to student populations of diversity. Innovative curriculum and quality coursework is designed to meet the needs of elementary education students guiding teaching and learning. For example; EDU222, Introduction to Special Education, students develop video presentations and infographics to convey content knowledge learned from weekly lessons. Socratic seminars engage students in meaningful in-depth discussion focused on works, readings, and case studies. CAC students gain valuable knowledge of multiple disability categories which provide an awareness of cultural barriers and effective strategies for working with all populations and those with special needs. The knowledge of cultures and diverse populations, including children with exceptionalities, within society carries over into all professions should CAC students decide on an alternative career path.  AAEE coursework is delivered by a highly qualified staff of adjunct faculty, one full-time faculty and one full-time instructional specialist. Among the adjunct faculty for the AAEE program are experienced career PK-12 and college-level educators. The current AAEE staff includes a current superintendent of schools, former school principals, director of special education, former CAC AAEE division chair, director of educational technology, current, former, and retired special education, classroom teachers, and other university adjunct professors. The combined experience of the AAEE faculty deliver high quality and innovative coursework. Among these offerings are portfolio writing, video presentations, analyzing statistical data and extraction of content in the development of infographics, higher order thinking, critical thinking, and problem-solving through discussions and Socratic seminar systems by means of current and relevant educational resources and case study scenarios surrounding education today and through synthesizing information gathered in conducting real-time interviews with current practicing educators. AAEE students engage in conversation and dialog with the difficult topics of culture, race, ethnicity, and bias, while raising an awareness of personal feelings associated with each. Opportunity for personal growth and insight into the social aspect of diversity and cultural differences are prevalent in the EDU course experience. The knowledge of cultures and diverse populations within society carries over into all professions should CAC students decide on an alternate career path.  Core coursework of study within the AAEE meet the Vision and Mission of CAC and the EDU department. EDU coursework engages students in learning experiences conducive to the pathways of obtaining a baccalaureate degree from Arizona’s universities in the profession of education and teaching.  Examples: Note\* Jose Ruelas, the creator or the first video slideshow for EDU230 Cultural Values in Education is hearing impaired and yet he chose to create his presentation on racism in slideshow video format with voiceover. [Jose Ruelas Video Racism](https://youtu.be/vKmuohO-Qy8) (used by permission from CAC student Jose Ruelas)[EDU221 Introduction to Education personal philosophy of education by Nick Garcia](https://youtu.be/Ggh-I0kYcC4)[EDU221 Education & the Law Video with voice narration by Samantha Trent](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D_8sUrkF_Wo)[Example 7 Reasons to Choose a Career in Education](https://acrobat.adobe.com/link/review?uri=urn:aaid:scds:US:8ef731d5-5605-35a6-9a88-b0c3f2eccc6d)Infographic/Brochure/Handout example: EDU222 [Example 1 -Communication Disorders](https://centralaz-my.sharepoint.com/%3Ai%3A/g/personal/cara_steiner_centralaz_edu/EZPzo-kAnxxJgMct0BkuKC0BS0c2gGJbj-rC8RogU8vaxg?e=hbH378) [Example 2-6 Principles of IDEA](https://centralaz-my.sharepoint.com/%3Ab%3A/g/personal/cara_steiner_centralaz_edu/ETVbhsiysY1PrQK-ydDzdxgBdzuIbWoT5PFtRoBBPsnc2Q?e=7x3lj0) [Example 3- IDEA-ADA-504-6 Principles of IDEA](https://centralaz-my.sharepoint.com/%3Ab%3A/g/personal/cara_steiner_centralaz_edu/EfHXm4lb6Z5NtbudxLI-u68BTt44m2YyPZmjXAEd9zfy6Q?e=FzBA1g) | **Is the program aligned with the college’s mission, vision, and strategic goals?** | **Great use of linked example videos. -****[Perfect elaboration, information, and examples to support CAC vision and mission. Exemplary** **Exceeds expectations 3** |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **4. Equity Statement and Evidence:** What efforts have been made to make the program more equitable? [**(Resources here)**](https://www.insidehighered.com/blogs/higher-ed-gamma/how-stand-equity-higher-education)AAEE curriculum and MSLOs have been reviewed for* authentic, project-, inquiry-, challenge- and problem-based assignments
* equality of resources, ideas, respect and outcomes
* Acknowledgment of differences, and taking steps to promote success for all students
* addressing gaps in persistence, achievement and completion,
* Equality and equity in grading practices and access to high-demand experiential learning opportunities
* socio-emotional and noncognitive factors linked to future success, ie; persistence, determination and an ability to overcome obstacles
* equity in creating a more socially relevant curriculum to acknowledge.
* ensuring EDU230 Cultural Values in Education is a required course, and all core classes address diversity, equity and inclusion to ensure every course in the AAEE program is culturally responsive to the diverse population of our communities
 | **Appropriate efforts have been made to make the program more equitable?** | **Built right into the required curriculum.** **Syllabus Statement?** **[3- equitable learning added/ changed to program**  |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **II. Program Curriculum:**  |
| **1. When reviewing the curriculum for the certificate and/or degree, are there any courses that need to be added, deleted, or modified?** The AAEE program continuously updates coursework and aligns with the Arizona Transfer community. At the current time the AAEE is undergoing a revision in coursework to for complying with Arizona Statute SB1572 which requires two courses in the science of reading for preservice and existing teachers. Request was submitted to the Curriculum department to:* Move to an optional course EDU225 Relationships in the Classroom
* Move to an optional course EDU228 Behavior Management
* Add EDU271A Science of Reading Module A – Science of Reading and the essential components of early literacy instruction at the elementary level and the developmental stages of literacy with strategies for teaching phonemic awareness, vocabulary and oral language, phonics and decoding, oral reading fluency, and reading comprehension.
* Add EDU271B Science of Reading Module B – Science of Reading Investigating Instruction, Assessment, Intervention, emphasizing, recognizing and understanding dyslexia, and intensifying instruction through interventions.
 | **Was any information given as to possible revisions to the course description, articulation, additions, revisions, or deletions anticipated?** | **Peer Review Feedback:**Clear review of ongoing updates - |
| Exemplary3 | Adequate2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **III. Program Outcomes and Assessment** |
| **1. What are the Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs) for the program degree or certificate as currently indicated in ACRES? If this program contains multiple degrees and/or certificates, the learning outcomes should be provided for each one.** [EDU EED123 2022-2023.docx](https://centralaz.sharepoint.com/%3Aw%3A/s/ProgramAssessment/EWUKEhxfZ15Av8UG7VY7OeoBWAPguV2IdvMu0aorknBniQ?e=og4v61)1. (Analysis Level) Analyze and integrate legal issues that affect students, teachers, parents, and administration in contemporary education using cases in which the concept of equity and equal opportunity have evolved into educational policy. (CSLO 1 & 2)2. (Evaluation Level) Compare and contrast current trends in education through classroom-based observations, current event analysis, reactions to readings, and dialogues with professional educators. (CSLO 2, 3, 4)3. (Synthesis Level) Analyze and explain the prominent educational theorists and theories and describe their impact on contemporary practice in education. (CSLO 2 & 4)4. (Synthesis Level) Analyze the tenets of a teacher's code of ethics and construct a personal philosophy of what it means to be a professional educator. (CSLO 3)5. (Synthesis Level) Examine multicultural education by evaluating the effect of cultural and linguistic diversity on classroom procedures and teaching strategies while identifying the significance of multiple cultures and /or language on classroom dynamics. (CSLO 1)6. (Evaluation Level) Examine and evaluate historical and contemporary trends in service delivery to individuals with disabilities utilizing the important components of Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act, The Education for All Handicapped Children Act (PL 94-142), Public Law 99-457, and the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act. (CSLO 2 & 4).7. (Analyzing Level) Identify research and scientific based systematic phonics instruction, recognizing and understanding dyslexia, and other current theories and instructional approaches for teaching reading. (CSLOs 1,2,4) |  **Are the Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs) for the program provided and are they relevant to the program’s goals?** | **Peer Review Feedback:****Seems fine to me**  |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **2. Are the outcomes from your program determined or influenced by any external organization, agency, or accreditor? If so, please explain. Are there any available accreditations which the program does not have, but may benefit from seeking?**Yes, the AAEE course outcomes and content align with[Interstate Teacher Assessment Support Consortium](https://ccsso.org/sites/default/files/2017-12/2013_INTASC_Learning_Progressions_for_Teachers.pdf) (InTasc) standards [Counsel for Exceptional Children (CEC)](https://exceptionalchildren.org/special-education-preparation-standards) standards[International Society for Technology in Education](https://www.iste.org/standards/iste-standards-for-teachers) (ISTE) standards[Model Code of Ethics for Educators](https://www.nasdtec.net/page/MCEE_Doc) (MCEE) standardsYes, two accreditation agencies are available for education in higher education:[Council for Higher Education Accreditation (CHEA)](https://www.chea.org/national-council-accreditation-teacher-education)[Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation (CAEP)](http://caepnet.org/accreditation/about-accreditation/what-is-accreditation)CAC’s elementary education program is not accredited. It would be beneficial for the elementary education program to seek accreditation from [Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation](http://caepnet.org/) (CAEP).CAEP is widely respected and acknowledged among the educational community. Accreditation would provide quality assurance through external peer review demonstrating alignment of meeting standards set by organizations representing the academic community, professionals, and other stakeholders. It would be advantageous for the EDU department to seek accreditation at some point in the near future.  | **Are any of the program outcomes determined or influenced by any external organization, agency or accreditor identified and explained? If not, mark not applicable. (NA)** | **Great links for standards Extensive information provided** [2- provided external accreditation links for AAEE but also have a program that is not accredited. Elementary Education. 2 because it has room for improvement but not bad because they acknowledge the need and potential plan for future.]They have identified a need for accreditation; major focus of the plan? It is well stated, could be 3 (or maybe 1?) - |
| Exemplary3 | Adequate2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **3. Assessment Results: Use this Assessment Reporting Form to share your assessment results. Attach assessment data or rubrics as an appendix.** *A sample Assessment - EDU 230 – as reported on the Baseline and Follow-Up Assessment Reporting Form – Click on the Link:* [Education Assessment Reporting Form](https://centralaz.sharepoint.com/%3Aw%3A/s/ProgramAssessment/EWUKEhxfZ15Av8UG7VY7OeoBWAPguV2IdvMu0aorknBniQ?e=XdAbuT) | **The information in the Assessment Reporting Form should answer the following questions** | **Great assessment.**  |
|  **A. What PLOs and/or MSLOs and CSLOs did you assess this year?** 1. (Synthesis Level) Explain how changing demographics influence public schools by evaluating the impact of at least three significant changes in United States demographics. (CSLO 1,2)2. (Application Level) Define multicultural education and describe at least 3 strategies to apply multicultural education in the classroom. (CSLO 1,3)3. (Evaluation Level) Identify at least five cultural and familial influences and their impact on modes of communication, perception and world view. (CSLO 1,4)4. (Synthesis Level) Discuss the intercultural dynamics in self, schools and society by relating 2-3 specifics when given simulated situations. (CSLO 1,3,4)5. (Evaluation Level) Compare concepts of individual and institutional racism; prejudice, ethnocentrism, stereotypes and sociotypes; and equity and equality from a variety of print sources, electronic media, audio/video sources, as well as independent interviews. (CSLO 1,2,4)6. (Analysis Level) Deduce how the concepts of equity and equal educational opportunity have evolved into educational policy by analyzing a minimum of five legal cases. (CSLO 1,2,4)7. (Analysis Level) Identify legal precedents for equitable educational opportunities by analyzing at least two landmark legislative acts. (CSLO 1,2,4)8. (Analysis Level) Analyze learning and teaching styles and how personal bias and ethnocentrism influence them. (CSLO 1,3,4) | **Are the PLO’s or MSLOs that were assessed identified and the department/program strategies for assessing learning outcomes described and information provided on how assessment results are collected, analyzed, and discussed?** | **Exemplary 3** [3- everything was provided besides the strategies] |
| Exemplary3 | Adequate2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1Seems fine -WRP |
| **B. Describe the assessment method used and criteria for successful achievement of student learning outcomes. (e.g., rubrics, licensing exam, internship, portfolio, exam, research paper, performance exam, EAC, etc.)**EDU230 Cultural Values in Education was assessed using a short answer format on a cumulative final exam. |  **Was the assessment method and criteria identified?** | **Could offer a little more detail with a rubric?** Can they elaborate: is this the exam with results given below? [2- would also like elaboration on the criteria. Was the final 1 short answer or was each question a short answer?  |
| Exemplary3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **c. How many students were proficient in the PLOs OR MSLOs and CSLOs and how many were not? What was determined to be proficient? (i.e., 70% = proficient)** Data was taken from EAC.Course 1- 88% of students attained proficiency on the final exam.7/8 students scored proficient on the final exam.1/8 students did not exemplify proficiency on the final exam.6/8 students earned a grade of A 90-100% (75%)1/8 student earned a grade of B 80- 89% (13%)1/8 student chose to not take the final exam earning a grade of F (13%)Course 2- 74% of students exemplified proficiency on the final exam (14/19)14/19 students scored proficient on the final exam.5/19 students did not exemplify proficiency on the final exam.8/19 students earned a grade of A (42%)3/19 students earned a grade of B 80-89% (16%)3/19 students earned a grade of C 70-79% (16%)1/19 student earned a grade of F 0-59% (5%)4/19 students chose to not take the final exam earning a grade of F (21%) | **Was data provided on assessment results on how many students were proficient?** | **Great results** What were the 2 courses? 2 sections of EDU 230? [Same inquiry as above? EDU230 is one course so I was a bit confused about what course 1 and course 2 meant. Each course had a different number of students so was this fall semester and then spring semester?  |
| Exemplary3 | Adequate 2  | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **D. What changes/improvements were made or will be made in response to the outcomes of the assessment process?**Exam format will be reviewed for revision to eliminate subjectivity.A rubric will be considered to clarify criteria and expectations for each of the exam questions.Exam questions will reflect specificity for the MSLO’s assessed.Revise the exam to a fact based only format utilizing the exam tool in Blackboard.Utilize the EAC tool within Blackboard to align exam questions with MSLO’s. | I**s an explanation provided on how MSLO and CSLO assessment results have facilitated changes/improvements to the outcomes of the assessment process?** | A good plan description- a 3? --[3 – yes **3-AP** |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **IV. Program Graduates** |
| **1. Discuss how the program supports current or future needs for the job market in Pinal County, the state of Arizona, and/or the United States.**EDU230 Cultural Values in Education examines the effects of culture on the formation of the child's self-concept and learning styles, and the role of prejudice, stereotyping and cultural incompatibilities in education. These skills are necessary for future teachers in an ever-changing educational landscape of diverse learners and the increasing diverse student population in Pinal County communities and schools. Instructional strategies, techniques, methods and understanding the pedagogy of teaching ensures a path for every student to achieve high levels of knowledge and understanding with the goal of attaining state teacher certification. Teachers must have a comprehensive understanding of diversity, equity, inclusion, and belonging as appropriate for teaching students in their charge. The skills learned in this class support future teachers as they strive to enter the diverse profession of teaching and learning. | **Was information given on how the program supports current or future needs for the job market in Pinal County, the state and/or the United States?** | **Peer Review Feedback:**Could the answer also include other courses, or the program as a whole? -[3- making the program require more equitable learning outcomes through EDU230 for teachers in a diverse demographic is very important. Great job with providing that. I agree with the above that, more supportive info about the program adding to the job market needs, would be valuable to know too] |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1  |
| **2. For degree programs, identify any specific in-state baccalaureate programs into which this program is particularly suited for transfer.** The elementary education AAEE program contains direct transferability to all Arizona universities, ASU, NAU, and UA. The AAEE program at CAC offers foundational coursework for elementary and secondary education programs and coursework may be used as transfer credits to the university of choice. | **Are any of the program outcomes determined or influenced by any external organization, agency or accreditor identified and explained? If not, mark not applicable (NA)** | Sounds clear - |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **3. Indicate if there are any articulation agreements in place for degree graduates.**N/A | **Are articulation agreements in place for degree graduates?** | **Should have plan or information about the ATF collaboration.**  |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **4. Discuss how the program gets feedback on its program and curriculum from external sources, such as advisory boards, employers, articulation task forces, accreditors, etc.**Pinal County school districts and schools provide feedback from hosting practicum students in this program. Partnerships and established MOUs with school districts within and outside of Pinal County have been established increasing partnership by 100% in the last five years. This allows students numerous school sites for completing the 30 hours of practicum field placement required of the program.Students provide feedback for coursework through the course review process. Mentor teachers at school site provide feedback for CAC students volunteering in their classroom upon completion of the field experience. | **Was information given on how the program gets feedback on its program and curriculum from external sources such as advisory boards, employers, articulation task forces, accreditors, etc.?** | Sounds clear Yes, field work feedback. **Would like to see investment in an advisory committee for the program.**  |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **V. Program Specific Resources:***In this section, please focus on program specific resources. You may, but do not have to, discuss resources available to the college at large such as Blackboard, the Learning Centers, Library, etc. However, if these resources are impacting your program in a positive or negative way which you would like to discuss, please do so.* |
| **1. Discuss the adequacy of the budgetary resources, human resources, technological resources, classrooms, labs and space, academic support for students (i.e.: learning center, library) and student support (i.e.: advising) available to the program over the past 5 years:**CAC resources are utilized as support services to students in need. Budget resources, technology support, CAC advising, academic coaching, and tutoring/learning center resources are appropriate for the needs of the program. The CAC advising team has effectively assisted EDU students and continues to advise students as appropriate for following the AAEE MAP. The team CAC advising team maintains open communication and questions to assist with guiding students in the AAEE program.Laura Shepherd has been highly effective with academic coaching of AAEE students over a two-year period of time. Laura will be missed but we look forward to working with Jeannette Verdusco as she moves into the position vacated by Laura Shepherd.Blackboard serves as our primary course content shell. All courses within the AAEE are online or live streaming which utilizes Blackboard collaborate as the virtual platform. The Learning Technologies department are responsive to the needs of the AAEE program. | **Was the adequacy of the budgetary resources, human resources, technological resources, classrooms, labs and space, academic support for students over the past 5 years evaluated?** | **Peer Review Feedback:**[2 or 3- had sufficient information. Did not touch on specific budget resources, HR, or detailed academic support areas.  |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **2. Does the program have sufficient resources to be effective and relevant?** **Explain:** Yes, sufficient resources have been utilized for effectiveness and relevancy of the program. Blackboard Collaborate serves as the primary virtual meeting platform and provides content and an assignments submission area for completed tasks, assignments and instructor grading.  | Sufficient Resources] | Insufficient Resources  | No Response  | [ Yes but would like to know what type of resources are used in the course. Blackboard is the platform where the class is built, and where students submit but would like to know what is included. (E.g., external videos, scholarly resources in the form of pdfs, articles, books, and instructor audio lectures? (beneficial to online classes)) |
| **3. What future goals does the program have? Will extra resources and funding be required to achieve it?** The AAEE program continues to work on MSLO alignment for all courses offered through EAC. This will provide future data for course review and the revision process.  | **Were future goals identified along with the extra resources and funding that would be required to achieve them?** | **Does working on the MSLO’s need any additional resource allocated to it?**  |
| Exemplary3[FB-3] | Adequate2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **4. Are there any anticipated budgetary needs within next 5 years that would support action plans for program improvement.** Budgetary needs are sufficient for the AAEE program. However, the newly approved post baccalaureate program in elementary education will need budgetary increases as the program grows and additional personnel are needed for communication and compliance with the Arizona Department of Education. | Sufficient Resources [FB – YES] | Insufficient Resources | No Response |  |
| **VI. Program Alignment with Institutional Strategic Goals:** |
| **1. How is the program directly or indirectly helping the College achieve its current strategic goals? Consider each strategic goal and provide a brief comment or description on how the program works to achieve it.**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **CAC Strategic Goals:** | **Aligned Program Goals:** |
| **Student Success***Ensure student success through retention, persistence, completion, and transfer* | New partnerships and MOUs have been established with school districts throughout Pinal County the state of Arizona. This provides opportunities for EDU students to conduct field experience at schools close to their residence. All EDU students are required to complete 30 hours of field experience/practicum during the program. These partnerships also assist with student placement within the elementary education post baccalaureate program at CAC. Many CAC AAEE students move directly to a classroom paraprofessional employment position during or shortly after engaging in practicum/field experience. |
| **Access***Ensure all Pinal County residents and others have access to high quality innovative post-secondary opportunities* | The elementary education programs ensure access to quality and innovative opportunities through offering relevant and valid coursework aligned with AzTransfer and degree pathways to Arizona state universities. Indirectly all coursework and program initiatives align with the college’s strategic goals. Innovative teaching practices, degree completion and job placement, respecting diversity and maintaining an environment of open communication and feedback among faculty and students are embedded components within coursework of the AAEE. |
| **Workforce***Ensure students acquire the skills necessary for job placement and that meet employer needs in Pinal County and Region* | The AAEE program provides foundational coursework and skills prerequisite to transferring to a university setting in pursuit of a bachelor’s degree in education and teaching. Upon completion of the AAEE, students are also eligible to work within school districts as a paraprofessional in the classroom.  |
| **Community***Ensure Pinal County residents have access to lifelong learning and cultural enrichment* | In collaboration with the CAC Community & Continuing Education Department the elementary education offers professional development opportunities for practicing teachers. New state legislative updates continually require practicing teachers and AAEE students complete specific coursework to keep certification current. A recent example is the science of reading/structured literacy courses which each practicing and preservice teachers in an educator preparation program must complete to teach reading at the k-5 grade levels. The two required literacy courses offered through CAC are required by Senate Bill 1572 have been vetted and approved by the Arizona Department of Education. CAC is currently listed as an approved vendor for offering literacy coursework and CAC is included on the Arizona Department of Education’s website as offering the courses. By staying current with legislative action CAC is able to provide lifelong learning for prospective and practicing teachers. The elementary education at CAC also offers continuing professional development for practicing and new teachers. EDU240, Structured English Immersion is offered as a credentialed course for teachers working in low socioeconomic areas. This course is also approved by the Arizona Department of Education (ADE) through the Office of English Language Acquisition Services (OLEAS). OLEAS approval and credentialed vetting places EDU240 on the ADE website as an approved course for earning the Structured English Immersion endorsement for teacher certification.  |
| **Environment***Ensure a safe, sustainable environment that promotes learning, communication, diversity and satisfaction among students and employees*. | The AAEE program maintains an environment of inclusion for all diverse populations and promotes a learning atmosphere for all learners. The AAEE program abides by the CAC Equity Pledge and strives to enhance the learning environment through sustainability and satisfaction for students and employees. |
| **Stewardship***Ensure optimization of fiscal resources through a balanced budget to support the needs and expectations of students and the community* | The AAEE program is inexpensive. The program sustains itself with current fiscal resources provided through budgetary allocations from the college. One full-time faculty and one instructional specialist II work together to maintain sound programming and fiscal responsibility. Seven adjunct faculty split teaching duties between AAEE course instructors and the post baccalaureate elementary ed program. All courses are offered online or live streaming which decreases the fiscal need for supplies and materials. |
| **Infrastructure***Ensure a physical and technological infrastructure that supports changes in learning and working environment* | The AAEE program relies on the IT department for infrastructure and support with Blackboard services. Most of the coursework offered with the AAEE is conducted online or synchronous live streaming classes. This allows the program to reach a wide variety of community members throughout Pinal County and the state. The infrastructure for students and instructors is dependent on the knowledge and expertise of the IT department. |

 | **Was a description provided on how the program has directly or indirectly assisted the college in achieving its strategic goals.** | **Peer Review Feedback:**[ touched well on each goal. 3]Clear goals- |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **VII. Program Effectiveness for Graduates** |
| **1. Describe how you measure the success of degree and certificate program graduates. For example, are graduate surveys conducted? Are surveys given to employers to determine satisfaction with program graduate employees?** Tracking AAEE student graduates is difficult. Although the MAP is utilized as a guide for student enrollment, coursework may be taken in any order making it difficult to track students as they graduate. Using the Online Arizona Certification Information System (OACIS) with the Arizona Department of Education (ADE) and the recent creation of a new data dashboard, tracking teacher placement within the school systems across Arizona will assist once students complete a four-year degree. With a recent upgrade to the process of data collection at ADE and the submitting of data from Local Education Agencies (LEAs – state school districts) tracking CAC graduates after state certification may become more conducive to the need of the college. Disaggregation of incoming data will have the capacity for filtering by college or graduation program. The CAC data dashboard will assist with tracking graduates as they leave the college. The program of study choice students select at CAC presents challenges to our program. Many students enrolled in AAEE coursework choose the Associate of Arts degree and not the Associate of Arts Elementary Education degree. This factor makes it difficult to pull data for graduating students. | **Was information provided on how the program measures the success of the degree and certificate program graduates?** | **Peer Review Feedback:**[3, provided information and knowledge of helpful tools to work on program measures for graduates. Is there a date for when tools can be used?] |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **VIII. Program Improvement Efforts** |
| **1. Describe efforts made to improve the program during the past five years."** (For example, this can include professional development, curriculum revision, the purchase of equipment, using assessment to enhance instruction, etc.)The CAC website has been updated with flyers and video to inform possible AAEE students. Coursework has undergone major revision and new mandated coursework developed to meet the requirements for compliance through ADE. The CAC elementary ed department developed a post baccalaureate program for community members currently holding a bachelor’s degree, the opportunity for taking coursework necessary to earn teacher certification in Arizona. The program was approved by the Educator Preparation Program department with the ADE August 2022 and launched January 2023. Many of these post baccalaureate students have acquired teaching contracts from districts around the state while enrolled in concurrent CAC coursework. The program allows students to have a paid teaching position while pursuing classes for obtaining teacher certification. This practice is known as Teacher in Residence (TIR) and students work under an Alternative teaching certificate for two years while completing the necessary courses. The post baccalaureate program contributes to filling teacher vacancies throughout Pinal County and across Arizona. These students work in a classroom under the tutelage of a site mentor teacher and CAC instructor. | **Was a description provided of the ways the program has engaged in program improvement?** | [3, great opportunities for new, recent, and current teachers in AZ. I know they also have information on their webpage for students to get scholarships under different types of EDU programs. Add that information is also great and shows improvement.] |
| Exemplary3 | Adequate2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **IX. Data and Trends** |
| **Leave this section Blank for now. It will be inputted by IR. You will be asked to comment on the trends and information indicated by the data.** [**(Click here for Data Package)**](https://centralaz.sharepoint.com/%3Ax%3A/s/AcademicProgramReview/ERNPWS66yL1Erl-I0i0fjwUBGHIxCo1EOglLBupfNT2iTQ?e=93Gzno) **Link updated 5/4/23 -AP** |
| 1. **Program enrollment data for the past 5 years**

Trend data for the past five years indicates a decrease in program enrollment from 2018-2021. Total student enrollment has fluctuated over the past five years with the largest increase manifesting in the school year 2022. Enrollment increased in 2022 from 133 students enrolled in 2021 to 204 students enrolled for the year 2022. This was an increase of 71 students from 2021-2022. The 2022 data 90.6% of AAEE enrolled students are female. The percentage of female to male enrollees remain constant with slight variation from year to year. The majority of AAEE enrollees are female and between the ages of 21-25.Enrollment for FY2022 shows the majority of students split between Hispanic and Caucasian students with a small percentage split between American Indian/Alaska Native and **tow or mor race/ethnicity groups.**The majority of students enrolled in the AAEE program are online students. This is reflective of all AAEE coursework transitioning to full online courses or synchronous live streaming coursework. Students may elect to designate the campus closest to their location during the application process but all AAEE coursework is offered as live streaming or online.A. Discuss and explain the factors influencing the enrollment trends: Covid had a huge impact on students enrolling in the AAEE program. Making the transition to online or live streaming assisted with accommodating student need. During the Covid shutdown when CAC offered free tuition, there was an increase in initial student enrollment, however, the dropout/withdrawal rate increased as the semester progressed.B. How has the program typically recruited students and marketed the program: The EDU website has been updated and maintained with updated information. A pathway MAP is posted which outlines expectations, suggested coursework from year to year, industry benefits, and transfer pathways to the university level for attaining a bachelor's degree.A day at The Capitol along with ECE spring 2023 was beneficial to bringing awareness of the AAEE program at CAC.Brochures and Flyers have been updated with current information to call attention to the AAEE program. Social media posts have been implemented with the assistance of the CAC Marketing department. Partnerships have been formed and 19 MOUs or IGAs have been completed and are in place for assistance with placing field experience/practicum students. Most are from Pinal County, however, school districts beyond Pinal County are also complete for students attending CAC outside of Pinal County.Partnership with the Arizona Department of Education’s educator preparation program department has been solidified and quarterly meetings attended to acquire knowledge and updates and legislative mandates for educator preparation programs. This includes the AAEE and elementary education post baccalaureate program. The goal is to continue to recruit students interested in becoming teachers at both the elementary and secondary education levels in k-12 education. | **Has the program enrollment trends for the program increased, remained consistent or decreased?** | **Peer Review Feedback:**[data displays enrollment was decreased but remained consistent for about 3 years, shown growth recently-3](section needs a little attention/editing- |
| Increasing 3 | Consistent 2 | Decreasing 1(section needs a little attention/editing-WRP) |
| **Were the factors influencing enrollment trends discussed?** |
| Exemplary 3[FB-3] | Adequate 2 | No information was given 1 |
| **Was information given on how the program typically recruits students and markets the program?** |
| Exemplary 3[FB-3, touched on marketing, Outreach, and partnerships] | Adequate 2 | No information was given 1 |
| **2. Program graduation rate trends for the past 5 years** Discuss and explain the graduation trends. What efforts has the program made to help students achieve completion?Graduation rates of EDU students have fluctuated over the last five years. The increase of graduates in 2022 was at a high with 19 students graduating with an AAEE. However, the 2023 date indicates a sharp decline from 19 students graduating in 2022 to 8 students graduating in 2023 from the AAEE program. | **Have the graduation rates increased in the past 5 years?** |
| Increasing 3 | Consistent 2[FB- 2 or 1, huge difference in graduating numbers from one year to the next. Is this attributed to anything specific?] | Decreasing 1 |
| **3. Students who enroll in a four-year college** No data is indicated for tracking students enrolling in a four-year institution after graduation. **4. Data on students who earn external certification or licensure.** All students pursuing a teaching certificate must complete a 4 year bachelor’s degree and apply to the Arizona Department of Education for granting teacher certification. No data tracking is in place to know how many CAC AAEE students are currently enrolled in a bachelor’s degree at the university level and how many CAC AAEE students have been applied for and been granted teaching certification through the Arizona Department of Education.  | **Has the number of program enrollees or graduates who studied at an in-state baccalaureate-level institution during the past 5 years increased, stayed consistent or decreased?** |
| Increasing 3 | Consistent 2 | Decreasing 1No data |
| **5. Average Salary for Students and Graduates and/or job placement information.** The teaching profession is stressed for qualified teachers. Salary data for one year after graduation indicates a sharp decrease in wages. The data in the above report does not accurately reflect actual teacher salaries. Teacher salaries fluctuate throughout Arizona from district to district according to the tax base and state appropriation of funds. Arizona schools are funded through the allocation of property taxes and the legislative process. The teacher shortage is a multifaceted commingling of mandates and the funding formulas implemented from the state and political climate. Arizona ranks 45th out of 50 states in the United States in school funding. In 2019-2020 the CAC EDU department participated in an ADHOC Collaboratives Process with AACTE, Arizona Association of Colleges for Teacher Education. The committee developed a policy brief presented to for addressing the statewide teacher shortage. [AACTE Policy Brief](https://centralaz.sharepoint.com/%3Ab%3A/s/EducationDivision/ESSJZ2PXavJCth1gfrXQUQQBdmAhj9evXhhAKz0-zTTrmQ?e=4xv0Qs) | **Were graduation trends and efforts to help students to achieve completion addressed?** |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | No information was given 1[FB- I don’t believe I saw any information supporting this question] |
| **6. Data Summary:** Provide a summary of this section. Indicate trends observed in the data, identify areas of strengths, and areas for improvement. Strengths;Increase in student graduates in the program. Increase in student enrollment from 2018-2022.Areas in need of improvement;Data trends indicate that recruiting efforts should be part of an action plan for the next five years.  | **Was a summary of the Program Enrollment and Graduation Trends provided and was there a reflection of areas of strengths and improvement for the program**. |
| Exemplary 3[FB- 3 different data and summary provided] | FB | No information was given 1 |
| **X. Evaluation of Program Strengths, Viability and Areas for Improvement:** |
| **1. After completing the APR Self Study, identify areas of strength and areas for improvement in the program. Is the program still a viable program? Discuss the next steps for the program and Action Plan Ideas.** As student enrollment increases it solidifies the viability of the AAEE program. The teacher shortages around the nation continue to be a challenge as districts look to recruit teachers from other countries, especially in rural district areas. The Philippines seems to be a “go to” country for hiring teachers in rural districts in Pinal County.Action Goals should include:* Increase marketing efforts across Pinal County and the state.
* Ensure compliance of coursework and alignment with state and national teacher standards.
* Participate in CAC recruiting fairs and events.
* Continue efforts to align formative assessments with student learning outcomes in EAC.
* Development of tracking measures for graduating students.
* Creation of an exit survey to assist in tracking student next steps to the university level.
* Continue to work closely with the Arizona Department of Education in identifying revisions to state law and teacher certification requirements.
* Ensure compliance and alignment of state mandated courses for the science of literacy and structured English immersion.
* Continue to market and increase enrollment of the post baccalaureate program for elementary education.
* Investigate and begin development of a four-year elementary education/special education dual certification bachelor’s degree program.
* Investigate and develop an AAEE for students interested in teaching grades 9-12.
* Investigate and develop a post baccalaureate program for secondary teachers with special education dual certification.
* Investigate accreditation procedures and requirements with the [Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation (CAEP)](http://caepnet.org/accreditation/about-accreditation/what-is-accreditation)
* Develop coursework for a one-day workshop around MCEE (Model Code of Ethics for Educators) for teacher compliance with Arizona teacher certification requirements.
 | **Were areas of strength and areas for improvement identified? Is an evaluation provided on whether the program is still viable? Were the next steps for the program and action plans identified?** | **Peer Review Feedback:** |
| Exemplary 3Sounds like a great plan-WRPShould they seek accreditation and not just investigate it?-WRP[FB- 3 agrees great action plan. I look forward to its results for all stakeholders. Students, community, and educators. I am glad these programs exist at CAC for Pinal County]  | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **XI. Overall Evaluation of the APR Self Study** |
|  **Are key findings that arose from the analysis and review process clearly presented?** | **Peer Review Feedback:** |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **Does the review provide a clear direction and vision for the program moving forward?** |  |
| Exemplary 3  | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **Does the review present specific strategies and recommendations for moving the program forward?**  |  |
| Exemplary 3 | Adequate 2 | Opportunity for Improvement 1 |
| **Scoring Rubric****If all sections were applicable:** |
| **Exemplary 99 - 84 (85% and above)***If all sections were applicable:*The program self-study fully addressed the core criteria in the self-study and review process. It discussed how goals and objectives are linked to the college mission and strategic goals. The program's student learning outcomes, curriculum comparison and assessment results have informed changes in curriculum, pedagogy, and instructional resources. Action Plans for improvement were identified based on the results of the self-study process. | **Good 83 - 69 (70 – 84%)***If all sections were applicable:*The program self-study addressed the core criteria in their self-study and review process, but some information was missing. It discussed how goals and objectives are linked to the college mission and strategic goals, and included action plan strategies, but more data, statistics and specific goals could have been identified. The program's student learning outcomes, curriculum comparison and assessment were given but specific information on how it would affect pedagogy and instructional resources was not provided. | **Opportunity for Improvement 68 and less (69% and below)***If all sections were applicable:*Not all the core criteria were addressed and there was information and statistics missing in many of the self-study areas. A reflection of how the self-study will lead to an Action Plan for improvement was not provided.  | **Peer Review** **Feedback:** |
| **If 2 of the sections were not applicable:** |
| Exemplary 102 – 87 (85% and above) Same criteria as above | Good 86 - 71 (70 – 85%) Same criteria as above | Opportunity for Improvement 70 - Below (69% and below) Same criteria as above |  |
| **Identified Strengths and Recommendation for Program Action Plan:** |
| **The reviewers noted the strengths of the program and would like to recommend the following actions to be considered when working with the dean to develop an action plan as a result of the Academic Program Review process.****Strengths: The program review was clear and detailed, with excellent graphical presentations of data.****Action Plan Recommendations: The course assessment implementation and plans for accreditation could be clarified with a few more sentences.** |
| **Academic Review Process Insight Statement**Take moment to reflect how this process has helped guide the direction of your program. |
|  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |
| **Instructions**: In this form, program directors along with the appropriate Dean should indicate any goals or action plans for program improvement over the next 5 years, which have been identified as a result of the academic program review process. |
| **Goal/Action 1: (**Type your goal here.)Strategic Goals Associated: |
| Cost/Resource Implications:Additional personnel for development and implementation of programs to recruit students and teacher candidates in the teacher pipeline for the rural areas of Pinal County.  | Timeline for Achievement:5-year goal: Program requirements take approximately one year to develop. Once a program is written via the Educator Preparation Programs with the Arizona Department of Education, it begins the lengthy process of review. Once passing the review process the program is passed to the Arizona Board of Regents for approval which takes several months. Each program may require a 2-year time period before approval. Coursework will be decided upon within the development process and sent to curriculum for approval. Revision may be warranted as the program goes through the program and curriculum approval process. | Measure of Success:Hiring of additional personnel Program approval with the Arizona Department of Education Educator Preparation Program (EPP) division and CAC curriculum department* Bachelor degree dual teacher certification – elementary education/special education
* AAEE degree for teacher candidates interested in teaching grades 9-12 secondary education.
* Post Baccalaureate program grades 9-12 secondary education/special education dual certification.
* Post Baccalaureate program grades k-12 special education certification.
 |
| **Goal/Action 2:** Strategic Goals Associated: |
| Cost/Resource Implications:Increase recruitment and retention of teacher candidates entering the AAEE program. | Timeline for Achievement:12 months | Measure of Success:Utilize CAC marketing team for assistance in posting the program with multiple media outlets and sources.Revise current marketing material for clarification, updates, and simplification. |
| **Goal/Action 3:** Strategic Goals Associated: |
| Cost/Resource Implications:Develop and implement AAEE student exit survey. | Timeline for Achievement:12 months | Measure of Success:Implementation of survey to AAEE students prior to graduation. Feedback on the experience and inquiry into student future plans and next steps to the university level.Reflection on survey data for necessary revision to program coursework and attainment of program outcomes. |
| **Goal/Action 4:** Strategic Goals Associated: |
| Cost/Resource Implications:Algin all course student learning outcomes with EAC goals.Add EAC alignment to post baccalaureate courses**Goal 5:**Develop a one day workshop course for state educators to satisfy the Ethics requirement from the Arizona legislature. The course would revolve around the Model Code of Ethics for Educators (MCEE) and align with ABOR guidelines for course components and elements. | Timeline for Achievement:12 months12 months | Measure of Success:Complete and submit spreadsheet for EAC alignmentAdd goals to each formative assessment in all post baccalaureate coursesApproval of curriculum components and CAC curriculum department.Implementation for offering the course.Approval and listing the course on the ADE list of vendors for ethical behavior as required by ABOR rules. |
| **One Year Action Plan Update**To be completed each December and submitted to appropriate Dean and Academic Program Review Coordinator |
| Discuss progress made toward Action Plan goals after one year:Submitted by: Update by Fall 2023 |
| **Two Year Action Plan Update** |
| Discuss progress made toward Action Plan goals after one year:Submitted by: Update by Fall 2024 |
| **Three Year Action Plan Update** |
| Discuss progress made toward Action Plan goals after one year:Submitted by: Update by Fall 2025 |
| **Four Year Action Plan Update** |
| Discuss progress made toward Action Plan goals after one year:Submitted by: Update by Fall 2026 |