**Academic Program Review Peer Review Panel Report - Rubric, Comments and Recommendations**

**Welding Technology Program AAS and Certificates**

**Date of Review:**

**Names and positions of reviewers:**

**Member:** Louis Teel  **Position:** Professor of Heavy Equipment

**Member:** Vickie Higgs **Position:** Academic Advisor

**Member:** Mary Kieser **Position:** Professor of Reading, APR Coordinator

**I. Program Description, Vision and Outcomes**

1. Does the program description provide the following information?

1. A synopsis of the program and curricular outcomes

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

c) Program certifications, accreditations and awards

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

d) The skills that graduates from the program will attain

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

***Comments on the program’s description:***

***The descriptions for the A.A.S degree and certifications are well written. After reading the descriptions, students will have a good understanding of the outcomes of each certificate and degree and what they will prepare them for. Does the program have any accreditations or awards? If so, it should be in the course description. In addition, you might add welding certifications that can be earned and how that it can lead to an AAS Degree.***

2. Does the program have a mission and/or a vision statement? If so, are the program’s mission or vision statements clear and reflective of the program?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

3. Is the program aligned with the college’s mission, vision, and strategic goals?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

***Comments on the program’s mission/vision statement and alignment to college’s mission/vision statement***

***The program’s mission and vision statement explains how the program is providing students with innovative learner success while providing quality learning experiences for lifelong success. An example of an innovative learner activity was provided. However, the statement could be expanded upon. You might discuss in the vision statement what earning a certificate does for a student. Does it lead to a higher salary?***

**II. Program Enrollment and Graduation Trends**

1. Has the program enrollment trends for the program increased, remained consistent or decreased?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Increasing* | 2 | *Consistent* | 1 | *Decreasing* |

2. Were the factors influencing enrollment trends discussed?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *No information was given* |

3. Was information given on how the program typically recruits students and markets the program?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *No information was given* |

4. Have the graduation rates increased in the past 5 years?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Increasing* | 2 | *Consistent* | 1 | *Decreasing* |

5. Has the number of program enrollees or graduates who studied at an in-state baccalaureate level institution during the past 5 years increased, stayed consistent or decreased?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Increasing* | 2 | *Consistent* | 1 | *Decreasing* | *Not Applicable* |

6. Were graduation trends and efforts to help students to help students achieve completion addressed?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *No information was given* |

7. Was a summary of the Program Enrollment and Graduation Trends provided, and was there a reflection of areas of strengths and improvement for the program.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *No information was given* |

***Comments on the programs enrollment and graduation trends***

***The self-study writers acknowledged that graduation results are not reflective of student success in the program since most students get industry certifications needed to get a job and do not apply for graduation and therefore are not counted. Most students do not pursue getting the degree, but do get a certificate. Is the degree program necessary? Or, should it just be a certificate program?***

***Is there a difference in starting salaries for those completing degree vs certificate programs? Is there an opportunity to expand on paid internships that could lead into a higher paid, full-time position with said company upon completion of degree?***

***Consider contacting other community colleges with a similar program (in & out of state) to see how they are marketing their programs.***

**III. Program Curriculum**

1. Was a curriculum comparison chart provided for each degree and certificate in the program?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *All were included*  | 2 | *Missing one or more*  | 1 | *Not included*  |

2. After reviewing the Curriculum Comparison Charts of the other institutions was information given into courses that could be added, combined or deleted for the certificate and/or the degree?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

3. Was any information given as to possible revisions to the courses description, articulation, additions, revisions or deletions anticipated?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

***Comments on program curriculum***

***There is a planned expansion of the program to four semesters. Is this for all certificate programs?***

 ***Revisions are being made, but they are in the process of them.***

**IV.** **Program Outcomes and Assessment**

1. Are the student learning outcomes for the program provided and are they relevant to the programs goals?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

2. Are any of the program outcomes determined or influenced by any external organization, agency or accreditor identified and explained. If not, mark not applicable (NA)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* | *NA* | *Not applicable* |

3. Are department/program strategies for determining how to assess learning outcomes described and is information provided on how assessment results are collected, analyzed and discussed?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

4. Is a common assessment being conducted to assess the MSLO’s for a common course in the program?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

5. Is a common assessment being conducted to assess the CSLO’s for a common course in the program? Is data included on the results?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

6. Is an explanation provided on how MSLO and CSLO assessment results have been used to improve instruction and/or student learning over the past 5 years?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

7. Was information given on how the program supports current or future needs for the job market in Pinal County, the state and/or the United States?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

8. Was information provided on whether there are any specific in-state baccalaureate programs into which this program is particularly suited for transfer, and/or if there are any articulation agreements in place for a degree graduates?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* | *NA* | *Not applicable* |

9. Are articulation agreements in place for degree graduates?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

10. Was information given on how the program gets feedback on its program and curriculum from external sources such as advisory boards, employers, articulation task forces, accreditors, etc.?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

***Comments on Program Outcomes and Assessments***

***What percent of students get certifications? What percent of students have to retake their certifications? How do the NCCER and AWS assess learning outcomes? What are the results?***

***A pre/post-test and/or survey could help measure student learning and provide data on the diversity of the cohort.***

***Is there data on what jobs/companies students are obtaining in Pinal County/Arizona specifically?***

***Add information about Welding Technology – AAS degree leading into Northern Arizona University (NAU) Industrial Leadership (BA) and Career & Technical Education (BSED) degrees.***

**V. Program Specific Resources**

1. Was the adequacy of the budgetary resources, human resources, technological resources, classrooms, labs and space, academic support for students over the past 5 years evaluated?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

2. Were future goals identified along with the extra resources and funding that would be required to achieve it?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

***Comments on program specific resources***

***The self-study writers identified budgetary issues for the program that are concerning. An Action Plan to seek more funding for adequate resources, instructors and renovations should be created.***

 ***More detailed information on how much funding will be lost with the ending of the Department of Labor grant. Has the grant ended? More detailed information on the cost of erecting the steel building. What are the funds needed from CAC and what industries/funds can you expect from outside sources?***

 ***Since students in the Welding Program are now required to pay fees, has the welding program made sure that they money from these fees are going into their budget and not into a general fund?***

**VI. Program Effectiveness for Graduates**

1. Was information provided on how the program measures the success of the degree and certificate program graduates?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

2. Was any qualitative or quantitative information provided to determine the success of graduates in obtaining a job in the field of study?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

3. If the program serves to prepare students for an external certification or licensure, was it identified, and were percentages provided for the amount of students who earn/achieve it?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* | *NA* | *Not applicable* |

***Comments on program effectiveness for graduates***

***In the past 5 years, the amount of students getting an American Welding Society certification increased by 3 to 59, and the American Petroleum Institute from 0 to 18. This is an impressive increase.***

***Great information on student completion! Additional data collection could be a valuable tool for the program and could support future budget increase request.***

**VII. Program Continuous Quality Improvement**

1. Was a description given on how the program has used operational planning goals to achieve quality improvement over the past 5 years?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

2. Was a description provided on the ways the program has engaged in continuous quality improvement?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

***Comments on program’s* continuous quality improvement**

***Good examples were given for how the program used operational planning goals to achieve quality improvement over the past 5 years. For question 2 of this section, what type of self-assessment was done?***

**VIII. Program alignment with institutional strategic goals**

1. Was a description provided on how the program has directly or indirectly assisted the college in achieving its strategic goals?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

***Comments on program’s* alignment with institutional strategic goals**

**IX. Evaluation of Program Strengths, Viability and Areas for Improvement**

1. Were areas of strengths and areas for improvement identified? Is an evaluation provided on whether or not the program is still viable? Were the next steps for the program and possible action plans identified?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

***Comments on program’s* evaluation of strengths, viability and areas for improvement**

***What industry partnerships are currently in place?***

**X. Overall Evaluation of the APR Self Study**

1. Are key findings that arose from the analysis and review process clearly presented?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

2. Does the review provide a clear direction and vision for the program moving forward?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

3. Does the review present specific strategies and recommendations for moving the program forward?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | *Exemplary* | 2 | *Developing* | 1 | *Inadequate/Needs Attention* |

**Final Score on the Quality of the APR Self Study:**

**If all sections were applicable:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| * **Exemplary 108 – 91 (85% and above)**
 | **Good 90 - 76 (70 – 84%)**  | **Needs Attention 75 and less (69% and below)** |
| * The program self-study fully addressed the core criteria in their self-study and review process. It discussed how goals and objectives are linked to the college mission and strategic goals. The program's student learning outcomes, curriculum comparison and assessment results have informed changes in curriculum, pedagogy, and instructional resources. Action Plans for continuous quality improvement were identified based on the results of the self-study process
 | The program self-study addressed the core criteria in their self-study and review process, but some information was missing. It discussed how goals and objectives are linked to the college mission and strategic goals, and included action plan strategies, but more data, statistics and specific goals could have been identified. The program's student learning outcomes, curriculum comparison and assessment were given but specific information on how it would affect pedagogy and instructional resources was not provided. | Not all of the core criteria were addressed and there was information and statistics missing in many of the self study areas. A reflection of how the self study will lead to the development of an Action Plan for continuous quality improvement was not provided.  |

**If 2 of the sections were not applicable:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Exemplary 102 – 87 (85% and above)**Same criteria as above | **Good 86 - 71 (70 – 85%)**Same criteria as above**Score: 76** | **Needs Attention 70 - Below (69% and below)**Same criteria as above |

|  |
| --- |
| **Identified Strengths and Recommendation for Program Action Plan:** |
| The reviewers noted the strengths of the program, and would like to recommend the following actions to be considered when working with the dean to develop an action plan as a result of the Academic Program Review process. **Strengths:** * ***The Welding Program has become more industry focused***
* ***The program is in close contact with employers to guage industry needs***
* ***Real life fabrication and steel erection have been added to course instruction***
* ***Additional pipe welding certificate and A.A.S degrees have been added***
* ***Stackable certificates to accommodate student work schedules***
* ***Block scheduling have enabled students to achieve more continuity in their learning***
* ***There has been an impressive increase in student licensure and certifications through the American Welding Society and the American Institute of Petroleum***
* ***Hands-on program targets specific learning styles***
* ***Welding Technology – AAS degrees leads into two NAU degrees***

**Action Plan Recommendations:** * ***Create strategic plans to market the Welding Program***
* ***Get Data from IR that shows industry certifications achieved by students***
* ***Change the program to a 4 semester model***
* ***Add accrediting agencies to the course descriptions***
* ***Seek increased budgetary resources for sustaining the program, renovations and additional instructors***
* ***Extend the Welding Program to the Aravaipa Campus***
* ***Identify ways that the program has engaged in continuous quality improvement (self-assessment and industry accountability)***
 |